April 5, 2011

Hon. Cathie Black Chancellor New York City Public Schools Department of Education 52 Chambers Street, Room 314 New York, NY 10007

Re: Trifon Radef

Nicanor Fernandez

Michael Cunningham, Sr.

James Coppola Morris Hampton Frank Chambers

SCI Case #2010-0348

Dear Chancellor Black:

An investigation conducted by this office has substantiated that New York City Department of Education ("DOE") Custodians Trifon Radef and Nicanor Fernandez, and at least four other custodial employees, engaged in a long-term scheme to defraud the DOE out of hundreds of thousands of dollars in custodial payroll funds by adding "no show" employees to their custodial payroll accounts at the Theodore Roosevelt Educational Campus ("Roosevelt") and Harry S. Truman High School ("Truman") both located in the Bronx. The investigation has also determined that Radef was essentially a no show employee as a stationary engineer under Fernandez at Truman, but was responsible for recording and distributing custodial payroll at the school. Fernandez ultimately approved the payroll, and signed off on payroll checks, for at least four other no show custodial employees at the school including Radef. In addition, this investigation has substantiated that Radef used several custodial employees to perform construction, painting, and maintenance work on his privately owned properties in Queens, while paying the employees through the custodial payroll accounts of Truman, Roosevelt or Public School 158 ("PS 158") in Queens.¹

¹ Trifon Radef remains assigned to his position as custodian at Roosevelt. He no longer holds a second position as a stationary engineer at Truman. Although Fernandez resigned from his DOE position as custodian at Truman effective December 9, 2010, he remains eligible for future DOE employment.

Initial Complaint

In January 2010, two custodial employees, Raul Laredo and Joseph Benvenuto, formerly employed at Roosevelt, reported allegations of misconduct to the office of the Special Commissioner of Investigation for the New York City School District ("SCI") alleging that Roosevelt Custodian Trifon Radef had employed numerous custodial employees to perform work on his privately owned buildings during their DOE work hours.² In addition, the employees alleged that Radef received a salary for a second custodial position, as a stationary engineer at Truman, but was rarely, if ever, present at the school.

In February 2010, SCI investigators conducted several interviews with Raul Laredo.³ At the time, Laredo worked as the Custodial Fireman at Thomas A. Edison Career and Technical High School ("Edison") in Queens during the daytime, from 5:00 a.m. until 2:00 p.m., and held the same position at Roosevelt, from 8:00 p.m. until 2:00 a.m. Laredo told investigators that Nicanor "Nick" Fernandez, the custodian at Truman, was formerly the custodian at Edison. Laredo added that, before becoming the custodian at Roosevelt, Radef was the Custodian of PS 158, a position he held while also serving as a custodial employee at Edison under Fernandez at night. Laredo added that it appeared to him that wherever Fernandez worked, Radef would follow and allegedly would work as a custodial employee.

Laredo told SCI investigators that, while Radef was the custodian at PS 158, he asked Laredo whether he was interested in doing additional work on the weekends at buildings Radef owned in Queens. Radef told Laredo that he would be paid his custodial fireman's hourly rate for the work and that he would be paid through the PS 158 custodial payroll account. Laredo stated that he regularly received checks which showed Radef's name and the school's address. Laredo told investigators that on at least 50 occasions, he had performed construction work and painting services at buildings owned by Radef in Queens. Laredo further informed investigators that Radef paid Laredo as if he were working at either PS 158 or Roosevelt. Laredo named numerous other custodial employees who also worked for Radef at his properties while being paid custodial funds,

² Raul Laredo is currently the custodial fireman at Thomas A. Edison Career and Technical High School in Queens. Joseph Benvenuto was terminated from his position as a custodial cleaner at Roosevelt in October 2010. Custodial employees are paid with DOE funds but are employees of the custodian, who is a DOE employee.

³ SCI investigators spoke with Benvenuto again in October 2010. Although Laredo had far more detailed knowledge of the specific players involved in the scheme, Benvenuto was able to confirm much of the information that had been provided by Laredo.

⁴ A review of New York City property records revealed nine residential buildings identified as being owned by Trifon Radef individually or jointly with Betty Radef. All nine properties are located in Queens County. ⁵ Laredo told investigators that the last time he worked for Radef at one of his properties was in January 2009.

and also informed investigators that Radef purchased construction supplies and paint for use in his personal buildings, but billed the items to his school custodial accounts. Laredo also claimed that Radef was on the payroll at Truman, but was rarely present at the school. Laredo told investigators that Radef was scheduled to work at Truman as the school's stationary engineer from approximately 4:30 p.m. to 11:30 p.m. each day. However, Laredo told investigators that Radef regularly spent several evenings each week at a soccer club in Astoria called Casa Galicia. Further, Laredo told investigators that Radef regularly would have lunch at Marabella Restaurant on Northern Boulevard in Queens, where he often would meet with other DOE and custodial employees during working hours.

Laredo also claimed that Radef improperly used custodial funds to pay several other custodial workers as "ghost employees," including Morris Hampton, a custodial employee at Forest Hills High School ("Forest Hills") in Queens, who also owned a lawn service company. According to Laredo, Hampton did all of the landscaping for Radef's personal properties and Radef paid Hampton by recording his time as a Roosevelt employee and paying him through custodial funds.⁶

"Ghost Employees" at Truman

DOE records indicate that, as the custodian at Roosevelt, Radef's regular schedule was Monday through Friday, from 8:00 a.m. until 4:00 p.m., and as a stationary engineer at Truman, Radef was scheduled to work Monday through Friday, 5:00 p.m. until 11:00 p.m. SCI investigators conducted regular surveillances of Radef between March and June 2010. On numerous occasions during that time period, Radef was observed at locations other than Truman during his regularly scheduled work hours. For example:

• On March 16, 2010, SCI investigators observed Radef leave Roosevelt in his vehicle and drive towards Truman.⁷ At approximately 4:00 p.m., Radef arrived at Truman at which point an unidentified individual exited the truck, and Radef left the school. Radef proceeded from Truman to his home in Floral Park, Queens, where he was observed by investigators. DOE time records indicated that Radef was paid for working at Truman from 4:55 p.m. until 11:00 p.m.

⁶ Morris Hampton remains assigned to his full-time position as a fireman at Forest Hills in addition to his part-time position at PS 158.

⁷ Radef was regularly observed driving a 2010 grey Toyota pick-up truck with New York State plates. Investigators determined that this vehicle is registered to Radef.

- On March 23, 2010, SCI investigators observed Radef leave the Truman parking lot at approximately 5:10 p.m. and proceed over the Throgs Neck Bridge, from the Bronx to Queens, ultimately arriving at the Marabella Restaurant. Radef was observed exiting the restaurant at approximately 9:07 p.m. and driving to his home in Floral Park. DOE time records indicated that Radef was paid for working at Truman from 4:57 p.m. until 11:01 p.m.
- On March 26, 2010, investigators observed Radef entering the Casa Galicia, with several other unidentified males, at approximately 5:07 p.m. At approximately 7:50 p.m., Radef exited the restaurant, had a brief conversation with another male, then entered his vehicle and left the location. SCI investigators returned to Truman to confirm that Radef had not arrived at the school. Radef's vehicle was not observed in the Truman parking lot. DOE time records indicated that Radef was paid for working at Truman from 4:55 p.m. until 11:00 p.m.
- At 3:00 p.m. on April 8, 2010, SCI investigators were informed by Laredo that Radef was not present that day at Roosevelt. Investigators then confirmed that Radef also was not present for his evening work hours at Truman. Later, Radef was observed by investigators at his residence in Queens at approximately 6:30 p.m. DOE time records indicated that Radef was paid for working at Truman from 4:49 p.m. until 11:01 p.m.

In addition, SCI investigators reviewed E-Z Pass records for the account assigned to Radef's vehicle for the period between December 14, 2007 and January 19, 2010. The records indicated that on more than 550 days during that time period, Radef was recorded as crossing either the Bronx Whitestone Bridge or the Throgs Neck Bridge, from the Bronx to Queens, during the hours when he was clocked in and subsequently paid for working at Truman. SCI investigators, calculating the number of hours between when Radef's vehicle was registered as passing a toll point from the Bronx to Queens and when his paid shift at Truman was scheduled to have ended, determined that Radef was paid for more than 3,000 hours of work at Truman when he was not there. 9

Morris Hampton, whose regular schedule at Forest Hills was Monday through Friday, from 3:00 p.m. until 12:00 a.m., was also regularly scheduled as a part-time employee at Truman, Monday through Friday, from 5:00 a.m. to 11:00 a.m. Hampton

⁸ SCI is awaiting the production of additional E-Z Pass records for the period between February 2010 and February 2011.

⁹ According to DOE payroll records, Trifon Radef received a base wage of \$23.38 per hour for his position as a stationary engineer at Truman. The E-Z Pass calculation demonstrates that, during the December 2007 to January 2010 time frame alone, Radef was paid approximately \$70,000 for hours when he was not present at Truman.

was observed by SCI investigators at locations other than Truman on several occasions between April and August 2010, during his scheduled working hours. For example, on April 19, 2010, SCI investigators observed Morris Hampton at his home in Springfield Gardens, Queens, at approximately 8:27 a.m. DOE time records indicated that Hampton was paid for working at Truman from 4:55 a.m. until 11:00 a.m.

In November 2010, SCI investigators interviewed Morris Hampton at his residence in Queens. Hampton told investigators that he was currently a custodial fireman at Forest Hills, and also worked part-time at PS 158. When asked about work performed at other DOE schools, Hampton told investigators that he would occasionally work at Roosevelt, but he last worked there during the summer of 2009. Hampton stated that he owned a private landscaping business and admitted that for the past three or four years he had performed all of the landscaping duties at Radef's properties in Queens. Hampton told investigators that Radef paid him in cash for the landscaping duties, but refused to tell investigators exactly how much he charged Radef for his landscaping services.

SCI investigators informed Hampton that, in addition to Forest Hills, he was on the payroll of two other DOE schools: Truman and Roosevelt. Hampton admitted to investigators that he had never worked at Truman and reiterated that he had not worked at Roosevelt since the summer of 2009. When asked again to describe his financial relationship with Radef, Hampton explained that at some point, he could not recall exactly when, Radef approached him with a blank check and asked Hampton to sign the back. Hampton stated that after signing the check, Radef gave him \$300 in cash. Since that time, Hampton had signed many checks, some with dollar figures included, and some blank, and each time Radef gave him between \$200 and \$300. Hampton stated that the largest check he had ever signed was in the amount of \$4,100 for which Radef gave him \$800. Hampton did not know how much money Radef had given him over the years, but admitted that he had been "seduced" by the "easy money." Hampton estimated that, in total, he had signed between 40 and 50 checks for Radef. Hampton further volunteered that Michael Cunningham, Sr., another custodial employee who worked full-time at PS 158, and also resided at one of Radef's rental properties, would occasionally meet Hampton with checks that needed to be signed and would deliver cash in return. Hampton stated that he believed that there were other custodial employees, including James Coppola and Cunningham, Sr., who also were receiving payments from Radef.

_

 $^{^{10}}$ SCI investigators visited Hampton's residence, and conducted the interview with Hampton, during hours when he should have been working at Truman.

During the course of the investigation, through information received from Hampton and others, SCI investigators determined that additional custodial employees, including James Coppola, Frank Chambers, and Michael Cunningham, Sr., were also likely "no show" employees at Roosevelt and Truman. SCI investigators spoke with three Truman custodial employees in December 2010 and January 2011:

- SCI investigators spoke with Truman Custodial Secretary Renee Allen who told investigators that she had worked at Truman for approximately 10 years, starting as a custodial cleaner before becoming the custodial secretary. Allen was shown a photo of James Coppola and responded that she did not recognize the individual in the photo, nor had she ever heard of James Coppola. Allen also was shown a photo of Michael Cunningham, Sr. and, likewise, stated that she did not recognize the individual in the photo.
- SCI investigators spoke with Truman Custodial Night Forman John Weinbrenner who stated that Radef was an infrequent presence at the school. Weinbrenner told investigators that Radef was responsible for the custodial staff payroll at Truman and was often the one who distributed paychecks to the custodial employees even though it was Fernandez who ultimately signed off on each individual custodial payroll check. Weinbrenner also said that he never heard of James Coppola or Morris Hampton, and that no individuals with those names were employed at Truman. When asked about Michael Cunningham, Sr., Weinbrenner stated that, although the name sounded familiar, he was certain that no one with that name worked at Truman. Later, Weinbrenner was shown photos of Coppola and Cunningham, Sr. and stated with certainty that Coppola had not worked at Truman during his time at the school. Weinbrenner did recognize Cunningham, Sr. as someone who had worked at the school approximately two years earlier painting stairwells during the summer. However, Weinbrenner was certain that Cunningham, Sr. had not worked at the school since that time.
- Investigators spoke with Truman custodial worker and Assistant Night Foreman John Donovan who confirmed that Radef was responsible for the Truman payroll and often distributed paychecks to the custodial staff. Donovan viewed the photograph of Coppola and stated that he had never seen the individual during his career at Truman. When shown the photo of Cunningham, Sr., Donovan stated that he did not recognize the individual in the photo. Donovan conceded that Cunningham, Sr. may have been one of the "outside painters" hired during the summer several years earlier, but was adamant that Cunningham, Sr. had not otherwise worked at the school during his 17 years at Truman.

¹¹ A review of negotiated custodial payroll checks confirms that it is Fernandez who signed the paychecks for Truman custodial employees.

In November 2010, SCI investigators spoke with PS 158 Senior Lunch Helper Frank Chambers. Chambers, a custodial employee for approximately 15 years, told investigators that he first met Radef in 1996, when Radef was the custodian at PS 158 and Chambers was working in the school's kitchen. Chambers stated that at some point, shortly thereafter, he asked Radef for some additional work hours as a custodial employee and, ultimately, began working part-time at Roosevelt along with Hampton. Chambers told investigators that Radef regularly would ask Chambers to sign checks but would pay him in cash, approximately \$1,100 every two weeks. Chambers stated that he rarely looked at the front of the checks and trusted Radef to pay him the correct amount of cash that he was owed. When SCI investigators confronted Chambers with copies of negotiated payroll checks from Radef's custodial account which revealed that the bimonthly checks made out to Chambers generally were in the range between \$1,700 and \$3,900, Chambers confirmed that the signatures on the backs of the checks were his, but refused to answer any further questions about the checks.

On November 2, 2010, SCI investigators contacted Trifon Radef and requested payroll records for Chambers including cancelled payroll checks. On November 23, 2010, Radef produced copies of six checks, dated between July and September 2010, issued to Frank Chambers. A review of the checks, however, revealed that all six checks had been negotiated on November 2, 2010, at an HSBC bank branch in the Bronx.

During a second interview on November 24, 2010, Chambers was asked to further explain his employment at Roosevelt. Chambers stated that, although he could not remember exactly when he had started at Roosevelt, by January 2010, he was no longer working regularly at the school due to budgetary constraints. Chambers also told investigators that in the past, Radef never gave him the vacation pay to which a custodial employee was entitled. Chambers further stated that since his last meeting with SCI investigators, Radef had offered Chambers a full-time position at Roosevelt and had given Chambers a check in the amount of \$4,900 ostensibly for back vacation pay that Radef said Chambers had been entitled to but that Radef had mistakenly neglected to give Chambers over the years. Chambers also informed investigators that Radef recently had called him and stated that he needed to rectify a problem with some of the checks which Chambers had received in the past. Chambers told investigators that on November 2, 2010, Radef drove Chambers to a bank in the Bronx, gave him a number of checks, and directed Chambers to bring the checks to a teller at the bank. Radef further instructed Chambers that the teller would give him an envelope containing cash in return, however, Chambers was not to count the contents of the envelope but was simply to return the envelope to Radef. Chambers stated that after he conducted the transaction, Radef gave him \$50 in cash.

¹² Frank Chambers remains assigned to his full-time position as a kitchen worker at PS 158.

¹³ SCI investigators spoke with several long-term custodial employees at Roosevelt all of whom stated that Chambers' employment at Roosevelt was infrequent at best.

In December 2010, SCI investigators spoke with James Coppola, a handyman at Intermediate School 25 ("IS 25") in Queens. ¹⁴ Coppola told investigators that he had worked as a part-time handyman at Roosevelt in 2007 and 2008 before injuring himself in 2009. Coppola stated that, after returning from medical leave in 2010, Radef informed him that there was no longer an opening for Coppola at Roosevelt. Radef suggested that Coppola contact Fernandez and inquire about the availability of a handyman position at Truman. Coppola initially told investigators that Fernandez hired him for several weeks of work as a handyman between June and August 2010, but he could not recall the exact dates. When asked with whom Coppola worked at Truman, he named Michael Cunningham, Sr. and Morris Hampton. SCI investigators showed Coppola numerous checks issued to Coppola from the school's custodial payroll account dated between January 2008 and July 2010. After confirming that the endorsement signature on the checks was his, Coppola changed his prior statement and told investigators that he had, in fact, worked at Truman as far back as 2008. When told that SCI investigators had spoken with numerous Truman employees who were not familiar with Coppola or who were not able to identify him from his photograph, Coppola responded that he usually worked by himself, and had little interaction with anyone at the school other than Cunningham, Sr., Hampton, and "Nick."

In January 2011, SCI investigators spoke with PS 158 Custodial Fireman Michael Cunningham, Sr. ¹⁵ Cunningham, Sr. stated that he had worked as a fireman for approximately 10 years under Radef when Radef was the custodian at the school. Cunningham, Sr. also informed investigators that he currently resided in an apartment in a building owned by Radef. Cunningham, Sr. told investigators that, in addition to his position at PS 158, he had also worked at Truman for the past five years. When SCI investigators informed Cunningham, Sr. that his photo had been shown to numerous custodial employees at Truman and that none of them could identify him, Cunningham, Sr. refused to answer further questions related to the matter and stated that he would likely hire an attorney.

In February 2011, SCI investigators again met with Laredo and Benvenuto, former employees at Roosevelt, to view photos of Coppola, Cunningham, Sr. and Hampton. Laredo, who regularly worked the 3:00 p.m. to 9:00 p.m. shift at Roosevelt, between 2005 and 2010, stated that Coppola had not worked at Roosevelt during his time at the school. Laredo recognized Cunningham, Sr. as a part-time painter several years earlier, but stated that he had not seen Cunningham, Sr. at the school, during regular hours, during his time at Roosevelt. Benvenuto, who had worked the 3:00 p.m. to midnight shift at Roosevelt HS since 2007, did not recognize Coppola or Cunningham, Sr. as employees at the school.

¹⁴ James Coppola remains assigned to his full-time custodial position at IS 25.

¹⁵ Michael Cunningham, Sr. remains assigned to his full-time position as a fireman at PS 158.

A review of payroll records from Roosevelt and Truman revealed the following information regarding the amount of DOE custodial funds misappropriated to pay the Roosevelt and Truman salaries of the above-named subjects:

- Approximately 72 DOE payroll checks were issued in the name of James Coppola, paid at the DOE custodial fireman's rate of \$20.33 per hour, from the Truman and Roosevelt custodial payroll accounts. Fifty-eight checks were issued from the Truman custodial payroll account, totaling more than \$100,000, between January 2008 and September 2010. An additional 14 checks were issued from the Roosevelt account totaling more than \$20,000, between September 2007 and October 2008.
- More than 80 DOE payroll checks were issued in the name of Morris Hampton, paid at a rate of \$20.68 per hour, from the Truman and Roosevelt custodial payroll accounts. Approximately 65 checks were issued from the Truman custodial payroll account, totaling nearly \$100,000, between February 2008 and October 2010. In addition, 17 more checks were issued from the Roosevelt custodial account, totaling nearly \$25,000, between September 2009 and April 2010.
- Approximately 78 payroll checks were issued in the name of Michael Cunningham, Sr., paid at the custodial fireman's base rate of \$20.33 per hour and the premium rate of \$31.71 per hour, from the Truman custodial payroll account, totaling more than \$100,000, between September 2007 and October 2010.
- Approximately 74 payroll checks were issued in the name of Frank Chambers, paid at the custodial cleaner's base rate of \$18.13 per hour and the premium rate of \$27.80 per hour, from the Roosevelt custodial payroll account, totaling more than \$125,000, between September 2007 and April 2010. 16

Custodial Employees Working at Radef's Properties

In October and November 2010, SCI investigators spoke with several custodial employees, or former employees, who were alleged to have performed work for Radef at his privately owned properties. Among those interviewed were:

¹⁶ During his interview with SCI investigators, Chambers insisted that he had worked full-time at Roosevelt during the summers and school breaks, and part-time during the school year on weekends.

. .

- Edison Tomala, a handyman at Roosevelt from 2008 through October 2010.
 Tomala told investigators that between October 2008 and June 2009, he was paid
 his salary, through his regular custodial paycheck, to do construction and
 maintenance work at properties owned by Radef. Tomala further stated that while
 working at Radef's houses, he often noticed that the paint cans and other supplies
 they used were affixed with labels or stickers indicating that they were meant for
 Roosevelt.
- Jaime Lemos, a handyman at Roosevelt since 2007, told investigators that between 2007 and 2009, he had been paid his salary, through a custodial account check, to perform work at various properties owned by Radef on approximately 15 to 20 days. Lemos further informed investigators that Radef also employed numerous other school custodial workers at his properties including a kitchen worker at PS 158 named Frank Chambers.
- Ramon Collado, a part-time handyman at Roosevelt, who occasionally painted
 apartments in houses owned by Radef between 2006 and 2008, told investigators
 that Radef would have him sign blank timecards and he would later be paid by
 check from the school custodial account.
- Jose Casais, a custodial employee at Roosevelt, told investigators that he had, on several occasions, performed construction and renovation work at private homes owned by Radef. Casais stated that the work was usually done on Saturdays and Sundays and that he was paid as part of his regular custodial payroll check.

Tomala, Lemos, Collado, Casais, and Raul Laredo could not remember the specific dates when they had worked for Radef at his properties over the years, and since they were paid as though they were working at their assigned custodial positions, their payroll records do not indicate which specific dates they worked at Radef's buildings in Queens. At the time, Tomala, Lemos, and Collado were being paid \$20.33 per hour as custodial handymen. Casais and Laredo were earning \$20.68 per hour as custodial firemen.

Through their attorneys, both Trifon Radef and Nicanor Fernandez declined the opportunity to speak with SCI investigators.

Conclusion and Recommendations

Trifon Radef and Nicanor Fernandez defrauded the DOE out of hundreds of thousands of dollars in custodial payroll funds by putting "ghost employees" on the payrolls at Roosevelt and Truman and by using DOE custodial funds to pay custodial employees for labor conducted on Radef's personal properties. Trifon Radef, Morris Hampton, James Coppola, Michael Cunningham, Sr., and Frank Chambers all participated in or profited from Radef and Fernandez's scheme to defraud the DOE. Although SCI investigators were unable to determine whether Fernandez profited from the scheme, it is clear that he regularly approved and submitted fraudulent payroll documents for at least four no show employees, including Radef, at Truman.

It is the recommendation of this office, regardless of any criminal actions taken against the above-named subjects, Trifon Radef, Nicanor Fernandez, Morris Hampton, James Coppola, Michael Cunningham, Sr., and Frank Chambers, that the DOE immediately terminate their employment, and that the DOE seek to recover all payroll funds which the above-named individuals gained by inappropriate means. In addition, SCI recommends that all six named subjects be made ineligible for employment with the DOE and that this report be taken into consideration should they apply for any position in the New York City school system, in one of its facilities, or with one of its vendors, in the future.

In addition, it is the recommendation of this office that the DOE review its oversight procedures. The current system allowed multiple individuals to be paid over many years although they never appeared for work. It is unacceptable that one or more supervisors did not question their whereabouts and uncover this scheme. The policy of allowing DOE custodians, and other custodial employees, to simultaneously hold multiple custodial positions at different DOE facilities added to the problem. The supervision of custodians and their custodial employees must be strengthened.

We are referring our findings to United States Attorney for the Southern District of New York Preet Bharara for whatever action he deems appropriate.

We are forwarding a copy of this letter and of our report concerning this investigation to the Office of Legal Services. Should you have any inquiries regarding the above, please contact Special Counsel Daniel Schlachet, the attorney assigned to the case. He can be reached at (212) 510-1418. Please notify Mr. Schlachet within 30 days of receipt of this letter of what, if any, action has been taken or is contemplated regarding this investigation. Thank you for your attention to this matter.

Sincerely,

RICHARD J. CONDON Special Commissioner of Investigation for the New York City School District

By: _____

Regina A. Loughran First Deputy Commissioner

RJC:RAL:DIS:gm c: Michael Best, Esq. Theresa Europe, Esq.